Greenhouse Gas Pre-Screening Measures for Sutter County

Prepared for:

Sutter County Development Services Department Planning Services Division 1130 Civic Center Blvd. Yuba City, CA 95993 Contact:

> Doug Libby – Principal Planner Steve Geiger – Senior Planner Phone: (530) 822-7400

Prepared by:

ESA
2600 Capitol Avenue
Sacramento, CA 95816
Contact:
Dan Dameron – Community Development Director

Tim Rimpo – Air Quality Program Manager
Phone: (916) 564-4500

FINAL As adopted by the Board of Supervisors June 28, 2016

Greenhouse Gas Pre-Screening Measures for Sutter County

Background

Sutter County's Climate Action Plan (CAP) includes a greenhouse gas (GHG) inventory, an emission reduction target, and reduction measures to reach the target. The CAP also includes screening tables used to assign points for GHG mitigation measures. Projects that achieve 100 points or more do not need to quantify GHG emissions and are assumed to have a less than significant impact.

Sutter County's screening tables apply to all project sizes. Small projects with minor levels of GHG emissions typically cannot achieve the 100-point threshold and therefore must quantify GHG emission impacts, an approach that consumes time and resources with no substantive contribution to achieving the CAP reduction target.

Approach

To counter this problem, Sutter County has developed a two-tier pre-screening procedure. This approach enables Sutter County to minimize time spent on small projects, allowing staff to focus their efforts on larger projects where meaningful reductions in GHG emissions can be achieved.

The two-tiered pre-screening procedure uses a threshold of 3,000 metric tons of CO₂e per year.² This threshold is based on a study conducted for San Bernardino County that used a statewide list of projects compiled by the Governor's Office of Planning and Research (OPR).^{3,4} In that study, emissions were estimated for each project within OPR's database. The analysis found that 90% of CO₂e emissions are from CEQA projects that exceed 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. Both cumulatively and individually, projects that generate less than 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year have a negligible contribution to overall emissions. Based on this analysis, San Bernardino

Atkins, 2011. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Screening Tables - Sutter County, California. April.

² The primary GHGs of concern for land use projects are carbon dioxide (CO₂), methane (CH₄), and nitrous oxide (N₂O). Each of these pollutants has a different capacity to cause global warming. The global warming potential (GWP) has been set to one for carbon dioxide, to 21 for methane, and to 310 for nitrous oxide. CO₂e, or carbon dioxide equivalence, uses each pollutant's GWP to represent total emissions as one number.

³ Atkins, 2011. Greenhouse Gas Emissions Development Review Processes County of San Bernardino, California. August.

⁴ The study used OPR's CEQAnet database, which is available at <u>www.ceqanet.ca.gov</u>.

County concluded that projects below 3,000 metric tons did not need to be evaluated using its point system, a system similar to Sutter County's point system. This allows resources to be focused on reducing emissions for those projects that can most substantively contribute to achieving identified GHG reduction targets.

Since the analysis for San Bernardino County was based on a statewide database, the resulting value of 3,000 metric tons CO₂e is also applicable to Sutter County. Sutter County has concluded that projects generating less than 3,000 metric tons of CO₂e would not have to be evaluated using Sutter County's screening tables. Such projects require no further GHG emissions analysis and are assumed to have a less than significant impact.

To determine whether a project has the potential to exceed 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year, Sutter County has developed the following two-tiered pre-screening approach. Under Tier 1, projects are pre-screened out based on project type. Certain types of projects produce limited emissions and will inherently not exceed 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. If a project cannot be pre-screened out based on project type, then a Tier 2 evaluation is needed. Tier 2 pre-screens out projects based on size. The maximum sizes of various types of projects are identified under which CO₂e emissions would be less than 3,000 metric tons per year. Each tier is discussed separately below.

Tier 1 Projects

Table 1 shows Tier 1 project types. These include projects consisting primarily of construction activities with little to no operational emissions. Many of these Tier 1 project types are linear projects, such as water, sewer, and natural gas pipeline construction, electricity transmission and distribution line construction, levee construction, and bridge and road improvements. These projects typically have moderate levels of construction-related GHG emissions, but almost no operational emissions aside from occasional maintenance activities. Except in unusual circumstances, emissions do not exceed 3,000 metric tons of CO₂e/year for these project types. Other project types such as cell tower construction, water transfer projects, and dredging operations would have a minor level of construction and operational emissions with GHG emissions substantially less than 3,000 metric tons CO₂e/year.

The project types listed in Table 1 are pre-screened out. They do not need to be evaluated using Sutter County's Tier 2 GHG screening tables. Table 1 is meant to be as comprehensive as possible but is not all-inclusive. The Development Services Director may determine that a project type not specifically listed on Table 1 can be screened out as a Tier 1 project. Such determination will be based on findings that the proposed project type is similar in nature and operation to those listed on Table 1, and will inherently generate limited emissions below 3,000 metric tons of CO₂e/year. For questions about whether a project fits within the Tier 1 list of pre-screened project types, contact the Sutter County Planning Division.

Table 1. Tier 1 Pre-Screened Project Types

Types of Projects Automatically			
Pre-Screened Out	Types of Projects		
	1) Pipelines (water, sewer, drainage, gas pipelines)		
	2) Electric transmission or distribution lines		
	3) Electric substations		
	4) New levees or levee enhancements		
	5) Bridge or road replacement or repairs (with no increase		
Projects consisting primarily of	in traffic capacity)		
construction emissions with no or	6) Cell towers		
negligible operational emissions	7) Fiber optic regenerator stations		
	8) Water transfer projects		
	9) Dredging operations		
	10) Habitat restoration		
	11) Rip-rap installation		
	12) Installation of fish screens and barriers		
	13) Drainage improvements		

Tier 2 Projects

Tier 2 applies to typical land development projects that generate both construction and operational emissions. Sutter County's Article 3: Use Classifications was used as the starting point to identify land use projects that would not exceed 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. When feasible, a land use air emissions model was used to estimate the land use size at which CO₂e emissions would exceed 3,000 metric tons.⁵ For example, 132 single-family residential development could be constructed and operated without exceeding 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. Similarly, a 134,000 square foot office park could be constructed and operated without exceeding 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year.

Table 2 shows the land uses for which the maximum size limits have been calculated beyond which emissions would exceed 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. The user should note that Table 2 is arranged to be consistent with Sutter County's Article 3: Use Classifications. For each land use type, an entry is included in the third column that shows one of three options: "Pre Screened Out", "Analyze Using CAP", or a number (indicating the land use's maximum allowable size limit to remain below 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year). As shown in Table 2, many of the agricultural use types fall into the Pre-Screened Out and Analyze Using CAP categories. Many of the use types, such as agricultural education and entertainment, are either temporary or intermittent. These use types are considered Pre-Screened Out because they would not come close to exceeding 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. Other uses, such as agricultural manufacturing, have the potential to include stationary sources. These

⁵ The CalEEMod2013.2.2 model was used to estimate emissions. CalEEMod was developed by the California Air Pollution Control Officers Association and is recommended for use by the Feather River Air Quality Management District.

uses have potentially large annual CO_2e emissions and should be analyzed using Sutter County's CAP.

Table 1.	Tier 2 Single	Land Use Pro	ject Pre-Screening	Table

able 1.	<u> Fier 2 Single Land Use Project Pre-Screening</u>	g Table	
	Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO ₂ e/year
150	0-03-040 Agricultural Use	e Types	
Α.	Agricultural Education and Entertainment	 Agricultural Education and Entertainment, Small Agricultural Education and Entertainment, Large 	Pre-Screened Out (both small and large)
В.	Agricultural Homestays		Pre-Screened Out
C.	Agricultural Manufacturing		Analyze Using CAP
D.	Agricultural Processing		Analyze Using CAP
E.	Agricultural Product Sales	 Wayside Stand Agricultural Store 	Pre-Screened Out (both land use types)
F.	Agricultural Supplies and Services	 Agricultural Supplies and Services, Light Agricultural Supplies and Services, Heavy 	Pre-Screened Out (both land use types)
G.	Agricultural Truck Yards	 Agricultural Truck Yards, Small Agricultural Truck Yards, Large 	Pre-Screened Out (Small)

	Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO2e/year
			For large truck yards, Pre-Screened Out when 67 trucks or less. Use CAP when 68 trucks or more.
Н.	Agriculture	 Agriculture, Animal Husbandry Agriculture, Crops and Tree Farms 	Pre-Screened Out (Both land use types)
I.	Animal Processing		Analyze Using CAP
J.	Intensive Animal Operations		Analyze Using CAP
K.	Commercial Stables	 Commercial Stables, Small Commercial Stables, Large 	Pre-Screened Out (Small or Large)
L.	Wineries, Breweries and Mills	 Wineries, Breweries, and Mills, Small Wineries, Breweries, and Mills, Large 	Pre-Screened Out (Small or Large)
150	0-03-050 Open Space and	Recreational Use Type	es
A.	Community Garden		Pre-Screened Out
В.	Campgrounds and Recreational Vehicle Parks		Pre-Screened Out

	Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT
C.	Camps and Retreats		Pre-Screened Out
D.	Golf Courses and Country Clubs		60 holes
E.	Marinas and Boat Launching	 Boat Launching Marinas 	Pre-Screened Out (Boat Launching) Analyze Using CAP(Marinas)
F.	Parks and Recreation		902 Acres
G.	Residential Recreation Facilities		Pre-Screened Out
Н.	Resource Protection and Restoration		Pre-Screened Out
I.	Resource Related Recreation		Pre-Screened Out
J.	Shooting Ranges, Indoor		Pre-Screened Out
K.	Sports Clubs and Shooting Ranges, Outdoor		902 acres
1500	0-03-060 Assembly and E	ducational Uses	
A.	Community Assembly and Cultural Facilities		70,000 sf
В.	Religious Institutions		137,000 sf
C.	Schools and Educational Services	Elementary and Secondary Schools, Public	Elementary – 62,000 sf or 1,081 students

Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO ₂ e/year
	 Elementary and Secondary Schools, Private Colleges and Universities Specialized Education and Training 	Junior H.S. – 167,000 sf or 1,099 students High School – 146,000 sf or 1,099 student Jr. College – 77,000 sf or 1,737 students University/College – 771 students Specialized Education and Training – 77,000 sf or 1,737 students
D. Special Event Facilities		70,000 sf
1500-03-070 Residential Use A. Agricultural Employee Housing	1. Agricultural Employee	
A. Agricultural Employee mousing	Housing, Dwelling Unit Agricultural Employee Housing, Complex Agricultural Employee Housing, Labor Camp	All Pre-Screened Out except permanent housing of more than 132 units
B. Caretaker Housing	Caretaker Housing, Agricultural	Pre-Screened Out (All 3 land use types)

Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO ₂ e/year
	2. Caretaker Housing,	
	Residential 3. Caretaker Housing, Commercial/Industrial	
C. Dwelling Units	Dwelling Unit, Single Family	132 Dwelling Units
	2. Dwelling Unit, Second Unit	132 Dwelling Units
	3. Dwelling Unit, Two Family4. Dwelling Unit, Multi Family	196 Dwelling Units 196 Dwelling Units
D. Group Quarters	Dweinig ome, water anny	328 Dwelling Units
E. Guest Cottage		Pre-Screened Out
F. Live-Work Residential		132 Live/Work Units
G. Mobile Home Park		234 Dwelling Units
1500-03-080 Community Ca	are and Assistance Use	Гуреѕ
A. Cold Weather Shelter		Pre-Screened Out
B. Day Care	 Day Care Center Family Day Care, Small Family Day Care, Large 	62,000 sf (all three land use types)
C. Emergency Shelter		Pre-Screened Out

	Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT
	Extended Care Facility		357 Units
E.	Residential Care Facility	 Residential Care Facility, Small 	Pre-Screened Out (small)
		Residential Care Facility, Large	357 Units (large)
F.	Social Services Facility		Pre-Screened Out
G.	Supportive Housing		Pre-Screened Out
Н.	Transitional Housing		357 Units
	0-03-090 Commercial Use	Types	
Α.	Adult Oriented Businesses		Analyze Using CAP
В.	Animal Sales and Services	 Kennels (a. Indoor & b. Outdoor) Veterinary Clinic (Small Animal) Veterinary Clinic (Large Animal) 	Pre-Screened Out (all three land use types)
C.	Banks and Credit Unions		38,000 sf
D.	Business Support Services		70,000 sf
E.	Commercial Entertainment and Recreation	Commercial Entertainment and Recreation, Indoor	Analyze Using CAP(both land use types)

Land Use Category	Land Use Type 2. Commercial Entertainment	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO ₂ e/year
	and Recreation, Outdoor	
F. Communication Services		Pre-Screened Out
G. Eating and Drinking Establishments	 Bars and Drinking Places Restaurant, Fast Food Restaurant, Full Service Restaurant, Mobile Food Truck 	24,000 sf (bars an Drinking places 4,000 sf (Fast Food) 24,000 sf (Full Service) Pre-Screened Out (Mobile Food Truck)
H. Funeral and Internment Services		Pre-Screened Out
I. Hospitals		89,000 sf or 134 beds
J. Lodging	 Bed and Breakfast Inn Hotels and Motels 	Pre-Screened Out (Bed and Breakfast Inns) 194 rooms (Hotels and Motels)
K. Maintenance, Repair and Rental Services		Pre-Screened Out
L. Manufactured Home Sales and Rentals		Pre-Screened Out
M. Medical Marijuana Dispensary		Analyze Using CAP
N. Medical Offices and Clinics		71,000 sf
O. Nightclubs		70,000 dg
P. Nursery	 Nursery, Wholesale Nursery, Retail 	Pre-Screened Out (both land use types)

Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO2e/year
Q. Personal Services		70,000 sf
R. Personal Storage		Pre-Screened Out
S. Professional Offices		178,000 sf
T. Recreational Vehicle Storage		Pre-Screened Out
U. Recycling Collection Facilities	 Recycling Collection Facility, Small Recycling Collection Facility, Large 	Pre-Screened Out (Small) Analyze Using CAP
V. Retail Sales	 Retail Sales, General Retail Sales, Outdoor Retail Sales, Superstore 	70,000 sf (General) 70,000 sf (Outdoor) Analyze Using CAP(Superstore)
W. Vehicle and Equipment Sales and Service	 Fuel Stations Vehicle Rentals, Sales and Leasing, Light Vehicle Rentals, Sales and Leasing, Heavy Vehicle Repairs, Light Vehicle Repairs, Heavy Vehicle Washing 	18 gas pumps (Fuel Stations) Analyze Using CAP (Vehicle Rentals, Light and Heavy) 65,000 sf (Vehicle Repairs, Light and Heavy) Pre-Screened Out (Vehicle Washing)

150	Land Use Category 0-03-100 Industrial Use T	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO2e/year
A.	Equipment and Material Storage Yards		Pre-Screened Out
В.	Impounding and Towing Yards		Pre-Screened Out
C.	Manufacturing	 Manufacturing, Light Manufacturing, General Manufacturing, Heavy 	207,000 square feet 285,000 square feet 382,000 square feet
D.	Research and Development	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	202,000 square feet
E.	Warehousing, Wholesaling, and Distribution		229,000 square feet
150	0-03-110 Transportation,	Communication, and l	Jtilities Use Types
A.	Aerial Services	 Airports and Landing Strips Heliports 	Pre-Screened Out
В.	Community Facilities and Services	 Community Facilities and Services, Major Community Facilities and Services, Intensive 	Analyze Using CAP(Both Land Use Types)
C.	Intermodal Transportation Services		Analyze Using CAP
D.	Parking Facilities		Pre-Screened Out

Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT CO ₂ e/year	
E. Solar Energy Facilities, Commercial		Pre-Screened Out	
F. General Truck Yards		Analyze Using CAP	
G. Wireless Telecommunications Facilities	 Wireless Telecommunications Facilities, Co-Located Wireless Telecommunications Facilities, Integrated Wireless Telecommunications Facilities, Freestanding 	Pre-Screened Out (all three land use types)	
1500-03-120 Resource Extra	ction Use Types		
A. Mining Operations		Pre-Screened Out – Borrow sites with up to a maximum of 1.1 million cubic yards of material mined annually Analyze Using CAP – Borrow sites exceeding 1.1 million cubic yards of material mined annually Analyze Using CAP - Sand and Gravel Mining with Concrete Batch Plants (and other types of mining	

Land Use Category	Land Use Type	Maximum Number of Units (and square feet) that Can be Built without Exceeding 3,000 MT
		that include stationary emission sources)
B. Oil and Gas Extraction		Analyze Using CAP

Although Table 2 works well for individual land use projects, it cannot easily be used to evaluate projects consisting of more than one land use. To address mixed or multiple use-use projects, Sutter County has developed an enhanced version of Table 2, formatted as an Excel spreadsheet. Table 3 shows an example from the Excel spreadsheet. For mixed-use projects, Sutter County (or the project applicant) would simply enter the number of "units" for each land use in column D of the spreadsheet. The spreadsheet calculates total emissions and shows whether the project would exceed 3,000 metric tons CO₂e per year. As shown in the Table 3 example, a project consisting of 50 single-family residential units, a 50-room motel, and 25,000 square-feet of general retail sale would not exceed the CO₂e threshold of 3,000 metric tons per year. Therefore, the project would pass the Tier 2 pre-screen and would be Pre-Screened Out from Sutter County's GHG screening table point system.

Table 3. Tier 2 Mixed Use Project Pre-Screening Table

Α	В	С	D	Е	F
	Sutter County Article 3 Use Classifications	Land Use Type	Enter Project Land Use Size	Units	Total Emissions (MT CO ₂ e)
	1500-03-070 Residential Uses	Single Family	50	Dwelling Units	1,128.4
	1500-03-090 Commercial Uses	Lodging, Motel/Hotel	50	Rooms	742.8
	1500-03-090 Commercial Uses	Retail Sales, General and Outdoor	25	1,000 sf	1,069.8
	Total Emissions				2,941
	Exceed 3,000?				No

The land use types included in Table 2 do not include every single land use type. Consequently, one additional pre-screening threshold has been developed for land uses not included in Table 2 or the Excel spreadsheet. If the land use type(s) are not shown in Table 2 (or in the Excel spreadsheet), the land use can be evaluated by answering the following two questions:

1) Does the land use(s) generate 100 or fewer operational vehicle trips per day?

and

2) Does the land use(s) include 50,000 square feet of occupied building space or less?

To pass the pre-screening threshold, the answer to both questions must be yes. For example, a land use of 10,000 square feet and generating 50 trips per day would be

pre-screened out because the trips per day <u>and</u> square footage values are less than the pre-screening criteria.

This pre-screening criterion can also be applied to mixed-use projects with the operational trips per day and square footages representing the totals for all land uses. For example, assume a project consists of a retail land use (10,000 square feet and 50 trips per day) and an educational land use (20,000 square feet and 60 trips per day). Although the total square footage for these two land uses is less than 50,000 square feet, the project still fails this pre-screening threshold because the combined trips per day of 110 exceed the threshold of 100. Consequently, the project would not prescreen out and should be evaluated using Sutter County's GHG Screening methodology.